



**COMPARATIVE STUDY OF SCHOOL-BASED  
SUPERVISION IN PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SENIOR  
SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN MAIDUGURI  
METROPOLIS, BORNO STATE, NIGERIA”**

**\*MUSTAPHA A. BABA IBBI; \*\*ASHEIK ALI KIME; AND \*IBRAHIM  
SALE BALI**

*\*Taraba State University, Jalingo \*\*University of Maiduguri*

**Abstract**

*The study compares school-based supervision in public and private senior secondary schools in terms of: classroom supervision, teachers' utilization of instructional materials, teachers planning of lesson and relationship among management supervision of teachers in classroom, utilization of instructional materials and teachers planning of lesson in Maiduguri metropolis secondary schools. Four hypotheses were raised and tested to guide the study. Survey and causal comparative research design was used for the study. The population of the study comprised of all the 48 school managers in 16 public senior secondary schools and 150 school managers in 50 senior secondary school in Maiduguri Metropolis all sampled for the study. Questionnaire was used as instrument for data collection. Findings revealed a significant difference between management supervision of teachers in public and private schools on classroom, there was a significant difference between management supervision of teachers in public and private schools on utilization of instructional materials, there was a significant difference between management supervision of teachers in public and private schools on lesson plan all in favor of private schools, there was a strong positive relationship between supervision of teachers in classroom and planning of lesson, there was a positive moderate relationship between supervision of teachers in classroom and utilization of instructional materials, there was a moderate positive relationship between utilization of instructional materials and planning of lesson. Based on the findings it was recommended among others that Borno State Government should organized training and workshop to school managers of public Senior*

*Secondary Schools on supervision of teachers in classroom, utilization of instructional materials, and teachers planning of lesson.*

**Keywords:** *classroom supervision, lesson plan, public school, private school, Utilization of instructional materials, school management*

---

### **Introduction**

School-based supervision refers to routine monitoring of academic and non-academic activities by principals, vice principals and head of teachers with a view to ensure quality delivery of curricula and extra-curricular activities in school (Ibi, Isa and Balasa 2019). The perceived declining performance of teachers in secondary schools across Borno State as a whole and Maiduguri Metropolis in particular could be as a result of negligence of duty, poor application of instructional materials, ineffective teachers' lesson plan in public secondary schools among others compelled many parent and guardian to send their children to private secondary schools.

Private schools are independent schools, which are established by non-governmental agencies while public schools were established schools, which are owned, managed and controlled by government. Okafor (2005) observed that private school is a type of education undertaken by any organization or agency besides the state. Both public and private secondary schools were expected to meet the university entry requirement as provided by National University Commission (NUC). The level of public confidence on government owned secondary schools is seen to be low.

In the school system, the responsibility of supervisory activities such as; classroom supervision, utilization of instructional materials and teachers lesson plan normally falls on school managers. School managers are professional leaders who hold the key position in the programme of instruction improvement through supervision of instruction. If the teachers are not well supervised, effectiveness in instruction will be adversely affected and instructional purposes may not be well realized. However, negligence in the improvement of instruction through improper supervision by the principal can go on indefinitely without being detected. This may lead to low quality of instruction and invariably, teacher's lack of commitment to job (Litchfield, 2003).

There are resources on teaching aids used in the teaching and learning process. Umudhe and Arisi (2006) stressed that instructional materials are different kinds which teachers and students employ in classroom in order to make the teaching and learning process more effective and productive. They are real things and representation of real things which stimulate one or more of the senses and which enrich the teaching learning process. An instructional material makes learning available to a wider audience, controls the pace of learning, promotes better understanding and helps to overcome physical difficulties in presenting the subject content. In school system, it is the responsibility of the school head to develop and maintain teacher's competence. The instructional supervisory activities by the school head include; checking of teachers' lesson plan, utilization of instructional materials and classroom supervision.

Classroom supervision as valuable tool which is employed to understand classroom reality and achieve high standard of effective teaching methodologies. Murphy (2013) highlights various aspect of classroom observation in terms of classroom control, lesson preparation, mastering of subject matter and use of vocabulary. Instructional material makes students understand more easily when teacher makes use of working model. It makes the teacher task easier and more effective. Utilization of instructional materials is the art of effective selection, acquisition and use of the instructional resources to enhance achievement of the lesson objective. Kay (2008) opined that instructional materials stimulates the students desire to learn.

In its National Policy on Education, the Federal Government of Nigeria (2014) identifies management of curriculum and instruction, supervision of classroom instruction, monitoring and evaluation, student's progress and achievement, promoting and enhancing learning environment, establishing and supporting continuous staff development and procuring instructional materials for teaching and learning as major supervisory function of secondary school principals. The policy also makes it clear that one of the cardinal objectives of administration in school, is to ensure quality control through regular and continuous supervision of instruction and other educational service.

Lesson plan is a plan developed by teachers to guide their lesson presentation in the classroom. Afolabi and Loto (2008) observed that supervision of the lesson plan should be based on the clarity and appropriateness of the learner's behavioral objectives, teaching learning resources and evaluation techniques to

determine the achievement of objectives and relevance of lesson notes. Ngala (2010) opined that the head teacher need to supervise teachers by ensuring that lesson is planned early, lesson is structured with an interesting beginning, revision of previous knowledge, teachers use of voice variation and summary of major points at the end.

However, the quality of public secondary school education in Maiduguri Metropolis is declining. This can be attested to as contain in the WAEC performance of students in Maiduguri Metropolis Secondary Schools. In 2013 about 7936 students registered for SSCE only 1016 passed in five subjects including Mathematics and English (equivalent to 13%), while in 2014, 8209 students were registered for WAEC while only 485 passed in five subjects including Mathematics and English (equivalent to 6%), while in 2015, about 6,821 students registered for SSCE only 1,023 passed in five subjects including Mathematics and English which is (equivalent to 15%).

Observations have shown that lot of people in our society prefer to send their children/ward to private secondary schools believing that teachers in those schools show much dedication and appear to perform better on their job as indicated in SSCE performance of students in private secondary schools in Maiduguri Metropolis. In 2013, about 7,069 students registered for SSCE examinations, 5187 passed in five subjects including mathematics and English (equivalent to 73%), while in 2014, 8,474 students were registered for WAEC 5,284 passed in five subjects including mathematics and English (equivalent to 62%). While in 2015, 6,672 students registered for SSCE 5,012 passed in five subjects including mathematics and English (equivalent to 75%).

The variation in performance among public and private secondary school students could be as a result of lack of frequent management supervision of classroom teaching and learning, utilization of instructional materials, and teachers planning of lesson in public schools as the essence of management supervision is to improve/enhance teaching and learning.

### **Study Objective**

The study aimed at comparing school-based supervision between public and private senior secondary schools in terms of;

1. classroom supervision in Maiduguri metropolis,
2. Teachers' utilization of instructional materials in Maiduguri metropolis,

3. Teachers' lesson plans in Maiduguri metropolis,
4. determining the relationship among classroom supervision, utilization of instructional materials and teachers' planning of lesson.

### **Hypotheses**

The following null hypotheses were tested

- Ho<sub>1</sub>:** management supervision of teachers does not significantly differ in public and private secondary school in Maiduguri metropolis.
- Ho<sub>2</sub>:** management supervision of teachers' utilization of instructional materials does not significantly differ in public and private secondary schools in Maiduguri metropolis.
- Ho<sub>3</sub>:** management supervision of teachers' planning of lesson does not significantly differ in public and private schools in Maiduguri metropolis.
- Ho<sub>4</sub>:** there is no significant relationship between management supervision of teachers in classroom, utilization of instructional materials and lesson planning in Maiduguri metropolis secondary schools

### **Methodology**

Guided by the Bertalanffy (1972) system theory which contended that a system has different parts performing different functions in such a way that each part interacts with and independent of other parts and with other system around it. Survey and causal comparative research designs were adopted for the study. The two were used because the study sought the opinions of school management on classroom supervision, teachers' utilization of instructional materials and teachers planning of lesson which survey research design was suitable. The causal comparative research design was used in comparing school management opinions on classroom supervision, utilization of instructional materials and teachers' planning of lesson in public and private secondary schools in Maiduguri metropolis. The population of this study comprised of 198 school managers which includes Principal, Vice Principal academic and Vice Principal administration in 16 public and 50 private Senior Secondary Schools in Maiduguri Metropolis, Borno State. The entire population was used as sample for the study. In line with the study of Sambo (2008) who recommended that the higher the sample the better the representation of the study. Self-design

questionnaire was used as instrument for data collection. The questionnaire was divided into two sections, section A contained demographic information about the respondents while section B contains 24 items which sought information on school management supervision of teachers in classroom, teachers' utilization of instructional materials and teachers planning of lesson in public and private senior secondary schools. The data collected were analyzed using mean score, standard deviation, unrelated t-test and Pearson Product Moment Correlation.

### Data Analysis and Result

The analysis was based on the number of hypotheses as presented below:

**H<sub>01</sub>:** management supervision of teachers in public and private schools on classroom supervision does not significantly differ in Maiduguri metropolis secondary schools

**Table 1: Summary of independent sample t-test on the management supervision of teachers in classrooms between public and private schools**

School Type	N	Mean	SD	Df	t	p-value	Remark
Public school	48	13.33	2.107	196	-14.54	0.00	Reject $H_{01}$
Private school	150	16.69	1.069				

Results from table1 revealed that there was significant difference between management of public and private schools on supervision of teachers in classrooms because the p-value (0.00) is less than the level of significant ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). The results further revealed that the mean of the private schools (16.69) is greater than the mean of the public schools (13.33).

**H<sub>02</sub>:** management supervision of teachers' utilization of instructional materials in public and private schools does not significantly differ in MMC secondary schools

**Table 2: Summary of the independent sample t-test on the management supervision of teachers' use of instructional materials between public and private schools**

School Type	N	Mean	SD	Df	t	p-value	Remark
Public school	48	13.90	2.587	19	-7.783	0.00	Reject $H_{02}$
Private school	150	17.47	2.828				

Data from table 2 showed that there was a significant difference between management of public and private schools on teachers use of instructional materials because the p-value (0.00) is less than the level of significant ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). The results further revealed that the mean score of the private schools (17.47) is greater than the mean score of the public schools (13.90).

**H<sub>03</sub>:** management supervision of teachers' lesson plan in public and private schools does not significantly differ in MM Secondary schools

**Table 3: Summary of the independent sample t-test on the management supervision of teachers' use of lesson plan between public and private schools**

School Type	N	Mean	SD	Df	t	p-value	Remark
Public school	48	14.02	3.258	196	-5.209	0.00	Reject $H_{03}$
Private school	150	17.09	3.646				

Data from table 3 revealed that there was statistically significant difference between management of public and private schools on teachers' use of lesson plans because the p-value (0.00) is less than the level of significant ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). The results also showed that the mean score of the private schools (17.09) is greater than the mean of the public schools (14.02).

**H<sub>04</sub>:** There is no significant relationship among managements' supervision of teachers in classroom, utilization of instructional materials and teachers lesson plan in MM secondary schools.

**Table 4: Summary of Pearson Product Moment Correlations between managements' supervision of teachers in classroom, utilization of instructional materials and lesson plan**

Variables		Supervision of teachers in class room	Utilization of instruction materials	Lesson plan
Supervision of teachers in class room	R	1	0.543	0.724
	p-value		0.000	0.001
	N	198	198	198

<b>Utilization of instructional materials</b>	R	0.543	1	0.614
	p-value	0.000		0.000
	N	198	198	198
<b>Lesson plan</b>	R	0.724	0.614	1
	p-value	0.001	0.000	
	N	198	198	198

Result from table 4 revealed that there was a positive moderate relationship between Supervision of teachers in class room and utilization of instructional materials used, Pearson's Product Moment Correlation Coefficient,  $r = 0.543$ , there was strong positive relationship between supervision of teachers in class room and teachers' planning of lesson used Pearson Product Moment Correlation Coefficient  $r = 0.72$ , also there was moderate positive relationship between teachers' utilization of instructional materials and planning of lesson used Pearson's Product Moment Correlation Coefficient  $r = 0.614$ .

### Summary of Findings

Findings from this study as contained above revealed majorly that:

1. There was a significant difference between management supervision of teachers in public and private on classroom and the difference was in favor of private schools.
2. There was a significant difference between management supervision of teachers in public and private on utilization of instructional materials and the difference was in favor of private schools.
3. There was a significant difference between management supervision of teachers in public and private on lesson plan and the difference was in favor of private schools.
4. There was a strong positive relationship between supervision of teachers in classroom and planning of lesson.
5. There was a positive but moderate relationship between supervision of teachers in classroom and utilization of instructional materials.
6. There was moderate positive relationship between utilization of instructional materials and teachers planning of lesson

### Discussion

Finding of this study suggest that the first null hypothesis was rejected. It further revealed that there was a significant difference between management of public



and private school management opinion on classroom supervision. The result further revealed that the difference was in favor of private schools. That might be as a result of lack of frequent workshops and seminars organize by the state government to school managers of public schools. The finding was in line with Oye (2009) who conducted a study on perceived influence of supervision of instruction on teachers' classroom performance in Enjebu North Educational Zone. He found that interaction between teachers and instructional supervisions influence to a great extent teachers' classroom performance. The findings is in harmony with that of Onuma (2016) who conducted a study on principals performance of internal supervision of instructional in public secondary schools in Ebonyi State. He found that there was a positive difference between urban and rural teachers on principal performance of supervisory function. This finding was equally supported by that of Dangera (2011) Anho (2015). Ekpoh, Imo, Eze and Bassey (2015) Enume and Egwuyenga (2008) Ayeni (2012). Finding on the second hypothesis revealed a difference in the favor of management supervision of teachers in private schools. This might be as a result lack of train and qualify school managers in public senior secondary schools. Findings of this study conformed with the results of Okenlu (2012) study on the influence of academic performance of secondary school students in Degema (Delge) local government area, Rivers state, who found that regular instructional supervision has a significant bearing on student performance. The finding contrast with Iwegbu and Eyo (2016) who examined the principals' instructional supervision and teachers' effectiveness in public secondary schools in Uyo local education, Akwa Ibom state. The study found that there was a significant different in teachers' effectiveness based on classroom observation, analysis and post conference analysis. However, findings of this study was in favor of private school managers. A finding of this study is not consistent enough this is because conference and seminar is not only effective for teachers' performance along, school managers also need to be train. However, some studies are only concentrated on management supervision in terms of frequency while this study focused on how open and effective does school managers supervising teachers. The findings is equally consistent with that of Freeman (2015), Olayinka (2015) Karget (2014) and Maruf and Amos (2011).

The third findings revealed a significant difference in favor of management supervision of teachers' lesson plan in private schools. This is in contrast with the finding of Chadzidimou (2014), Ramaligela (2012), Gafavour and Umar (2010), Hidayet (2015), Okuede (2016) Simwa and Madiba (2015). Some school managers are supervising teachers but they are weak in the supervision, therefore it is not all school managers that are train and qualify enough to supervise teachers. However, there is need for conference and workshop to be organize for school managers especially for public schools as details of the analysis revealed the weakness of them.

The fourth hypothesis indicated that there was a significant relationship between management supervision of teachers in classroom, utilization of instructional materials and lesson plan. The result revealed that there was a positive moderate relationship between supervision of teachers in classroom and utilization of instructional materials, there was a strong positive relationship between supervision of teachers in classroom and teachers planning. Also there was moderate positive relationship between teachers' utilization of instructional materials and planning of lesson. The finding was in line with the study of Sule, Anika, Amoh, Egbou and mercy (2015) who examined the relationship between instructional supervisory practice and teachers' role effectiveness in secondary schools of Calabar South Local Government of Cross River State. Findings of their study revealed that there was a significant positive relationship between instructional supervisory practice of checking teachers lesson plan and students' academic performance. Also the finding was in line with Sule Aroband Alade (2012), Alimi and Akintola (2012), Okendu(2012).

Accordingly, the Finding indicated that there was a strong positive relationship between supervision of teachers in classroom and planning of lesson. The finding of this study was in line with the study of Sule, Anike, Ameh, Egbou and Mercy (2015) who conducted a study on relationship between instructional supervisory practice and teachers' role effectiveness in pubic Secondary Schools in Calabar South Local Government Area of Cross River State. The study found that there was a strong positive relationship between instructional supervisory practice of checking teachers lesson plan, frequent and continues instruction practice rather than partial, unscheduled supervisory activities by school managers. However, finding of this study was in line with study of (Okendu 2018) who found that there was a strong positive relationship between

school head supervision and teacher commitment in classroom. Furthermore, the findings of this study conform with the study of Ekpoh, Imo, Bassey (2015) who conducted a study on principals' supervisory techniques and teachers job performance in secondary schools in Ikom education zone. Findings revealed a significant relationship between management supervision techniques in terms of classroom supervision and teachers job performance.

Fifth finding indicated that there was a moderate positive relationship between supervision of teachers in classroom and utilization of instructional material. This is in line with the study of Bukar and Olatuji (2015) who conducted a study on principals' supervisory role, resource utilization and students' academic achievement in senior secondary schools Borno State. The findings revealed that the available resources in the sampled senior secondary schools in Borno State were not properly supervised and underutilized.

Sixth finding indicated that there was a moderate positive relationship between utilization of instructional materials and teachers lesson plan. Also the finding of the study agreed with the study of Peretomode (2001) who posited that for teachers to perform their teaching duties effectively, management must always check teachers lesson preparation and utilization of instructional materials. The study also conforms with that of Ngeru (2015) who established that there was no significant correlation between teachers' educational background and the utilization of instructional materials in sub countries.

### **Conclusion**

Based on the findings of this study, the researcher concluded that there was a significant difference between management supervision of teachers in public and private schools on classroom supervision, utilization of instructional materials, teachers lesson plan, the differences was in favor of private schools, this indicated that managers of private schools were always supervised their teachers in terms of utilization of instruction material, lesson preparation and presentation in classroom, however, there was a positive relationship among management supervision of teachers in public and private schools on utilization of instructional materials and teachers planning of lesson.

### **Recommendation**

Based on the findings of this study the following recommendations were made:

1. Borno state Ministry of Education should made it a point of duty to all school manager to daily supervision of teachers in classroom activities.
2. Borno state government should organize training and workshop on management supervision of teachers' utilization of instructional materials in public senior secondary schools.
3. Borno state government should organize training and workshop on management supervision of teachers' lesson preparation and presentation in public senior secondary schools.
4. Borno State Ministry of Education should encourage school management of public senior secondary schools on frequent supervision of teachers in terms of lesson preparation, utilization of instructional materials and classroom supervision.

## REFERENCES

- Afolabi, F.&Loto, A.B. (2008) The Head Teacher and Quality Control in Prim Education through Effective Intra School Supervision in Nigeria. *Journal Teachers Perspectives*, 3(2), 4-25
- Alimi, O.S& Akintola, C.A (2012). The impact of selected modes of instructional supervision activities on students' academic performance in senior secondary schools in Ondo state, Nigeria. *Educational research journal*, 2(1), 1-6
- Anho, R.O (2015). Relationship Between Principals Supervision and Teachers Classroom Management in Public Secondary Schools, Delta state, Nigeria, *Basic research journal of education* 4(3), 45-55.
- Ayeni, A.j (2002). Assessment of principals' supervisory role for quality assurance in Secondary school in Ondo state, Nigeria. *World journal of education*, 1(2), 62-68.
- Bertalanffy. L.V. (1972). General Foundation, development and application; G New York Brazuler press.
- Bukar, I.B&Olatunji, O.R. (2005). Principals' supervisory role, resources utilization and students' academic achievement in senior secondary schools, Borno State, Nigeria *Maiduguri journal of educational studies*, 1(8), 219-226.
- Chatzidimouzou, K. (2014). Greek Teachers on Micro-level lesson preparation and planning, university of the Aegean Greece, *International journal of Humanities and social science* 10 (4) 268-278.
- Dangara, U.Y. (2011). The impact of instructional supervision on academic performance of secondary school students in Nasarawa state, Nigeria. *Journal of Education and Practice* 10 (6), 160-167
- Enume, C.P and Egwunyenga, E.J (2008). Principals instructional leadership roles and effects On teachers' job performance: A case study of secondary schools in Asaba Metropolis, Delta state, Nigeria. *Educational journal of social science*, 16(1), 13-17.
- Federal Republic of Nigeria, (F.G.N), (2014). National policy on Education 4<sup>th</sup> (Revise edition) NERDC press

- Freeman, O.K. (2005). The importance of instructional materials to the implementation of Social Studies curriculum at junior secondary school level. *Journal of curriculum and research Nsukka* (4), 48-58
- Gafoor, A.&Umar Farooque, T.K (2016). Ways to improve lesson plan: a student's Teachers perspective, international seminar conference on teachers' empowerment and institutional effectiveness, all India association for educational research at maharaja Madakarinyaka, college Chita Durga, Karanataka, India. *Global Journal of Education Research*; 2(1), 1-10
- Ibi, M.B., Isa J.S, and Balasa M (2019). Teaching Practice and Supervision (practical approach) for teachers and students: Qalam Publications Inc.
- Iwegbu, E.E and Eyo, E.E. (2016). Principal instructional supervision and teachers Effectiveness in public secondary school, Uyo local education Akwa Ibomstate. *British journal of education*. 7 (4), 99-109
- Kurgat, S.J. (2014). Availability and use of instructional materials toward enhancing students' performance in secondary schools, A case study of Riff Valley province, Kenya, *Journal of education and practice*, 33(5) 116-121.
- Lithfield, D.J (2003). If you want me to be instructional leader, just tell me what an Instructional does, *Peabody journal of education* 63(1), 202-205
- Maruf, A.&Amos, O. (2011). Instructional materials and students' academic achievement in Mathematics; *European Journal of Humanity and social science*. 1 (2), 2220-2226.
- Murphy, R. (2013). Testing Teachers: what work best for teachers' evaluation and appraisal.
- Ngala, F.B. (2010). Management of Teachers and its Influence on Students Academic Achievement in Primary Schools of Eldoret Municipality, unpublished M. Phil, Thesis, University Eldoret Kenya
- Ngeru, E.W. (2015). Influence of teachers' characteristics on utilization of instructional resources in teaching number of work in pre-schools in Westland sub-country Nairobi country. (Unpublished dissertation departments of education, University of Nairobi).
- Okafor, F.C (2005). Philosophy of education and third world prospective, Enugu; Star Publishing company.
- Okende, E.O. (2018). Effectiveness of heads of schools in supervising teachers' Teaching Activities in secondary schools in Tanzania. *Informal Journal of science research and management* 4(6), 91-117.
- Okendu, J.M. (2012). The influence of instructional process and supervision on academic performance of secondary school students of River state, Nigeria. (unpublished dissertation), department of educational management and planning, University of science technology, port Harcourt, River state, Nigeria.
- Okwuedei, C.A (2016). Enhancing purposeful classroom possess through actual supervision of the implementation of lesson plan. *Multidisciplinary, journal of research and development*, 7(1), 122-126.
- Onuma,N. (2016). Principals performance of internal supervision of institution in public secondary schools in Ebonyi State, Nigeria. *British journal of Education*, 3(4), 40-52.
- Oye, O.O. (2009). Perceived influence of supervision of instruction on teachers' classroom performance in ijebu- north educational zone of Ogun state, Nigeria. (Unpublished M.ed Dissertation), university of Nigeria Nsukka.
- Olayinka, A.R.B. (2015). Effect of instructional materials on secondary school students' academic achievement in social studies in Ekiti state, Nigeria. *Word journal of education* 1(16), 32-38

- Peretomode, V.F (2011) introduction to educational administration, planning and supervision, Ikeja; Joja research and publisher limited.
- Ramaligela, S.M. (2012). Can lesson plan affect lesson presentation in mathematics students' teachers', teaching practice in schools, *south Africa journal of education*, 19 (47), 87 91.
- Sambo, A.A. (2008). Research Method in Education, Zaria Nigeria Asekoma Publisher.
- Sule, M. A, Aroband, F. O& Alade, F.O. (2012). principals' classroom visitation, inspection and teachers job performance in Akwa Ibom state, Nigeria. *Research on Humanity and Social science* 2(11), 106-111.
- Simwa, .KH. &Modiba, M. (2015), Interrogating the lesson plan in a preservice method course; evidence from a university of Kenya, *Australia Journal of teacher education*, 40(4) the universal Basic Education programme in Enugu Metropolis, (unpublished dissertation)
- Umudhe, S.K&Arisi R.O. (2006). Instructional materials in Inomusa. Osakure E.O (ed) tertiary institution. Warri: Abort Research Publisher 2<sup>nd</sup> edition.
- West Africa Examination Council, (2016). Reports WAEC Board Maiduguri: Nigeria